Bibliotheek

Faculteit Soc. Wet. Journal of the

Wassenaarseweg 52

2333 AK Leiden

# History of the

## **Behavioral Sciences**

VOL. XXVIII

JANUARY 1992

NO. 1

Published Quarterly by

Clinical Psychology Publishing Co., Inc. 4 Conant Square Brandon, Vermont 05733

> Editor BARBARA ROSS Psychology Department
> University of Massachusetts — Boston
> Harbor Campus
> 100 Morrissey Boulevard
> Boston, Mass. 02125-3393

> > Copy Editor WARREN K. ROSS, JR.

### NOTICE TO CONTRIBUTORS

THE JOURNAL OF THE HISTORY OF THE BEHAVIORAL SCIENCES is published quarterly at Brandon, Vermont, by the Clinical Psychology Publishing Company, Inc. Institutional subscription price \$115.00 per year; special rate to members of APA, Cheiron, and other national professional organizations \$45.00; foreign subscriptions add \$11.00 per year. Write to: CPPC, 4 Conant Square, Brandon, Vermont 05733. Second-class postage paid at Brandon, Vermont 05733, and at additional offices.

Two copies of manuscripts should be submitted to the Editor, Barbara Ross, Psychology Department, University of Massachusetts, Boston, MA 02125. An abstract of approximately 100 words and brief biographical statement should be included. Manuscripts should be in clear typescript, double-spaced on one side, with footnotes double-spaced at the end. Lengthy quotations, indented in the text, should also be double-spaced. Accepted manuscripts are not returned with galleys, which makes it imperative that the author retain a copy. If the author wants the extra copy of a manuscript that has not been accepted returned, a self-addressed, stamped, large envelope must be included. Letters and items for inclusion in News and Notes, such as information about graduate programs, conferences, grants, dissertations recently completed or in progress, and other communications of interest to readers, should also be sent to the Editor. The Journal does not publish translations of previously published works.

JHBS is abstracted in the following: Abstracts in Anthropology, America: History and Life, Automatic Subject Citation Index, Current Contents - Social and Behavioral Sciences, Current Work in the History of Medicine, Historical Abstracts, Index Medicus, Psychoanalytic Quarterly, Psychological Abstracts, Social Sciences Citation Index, Mental Health Abstracts, Chicorel Abstracts to Reading and Learning Disabilities, and Sociological Abstracts. Microform editions of the journal are available, after a three-year publication lag, from MIMC, Fairview Park, Elmsford, NY 10523.

The Journal has adopted the stylistic recommendations of A Manual of Style, 13th ed. rev. (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1982), except that reference lists should either be eliminated or incorporated into footnotes. For all special problems refer to the Manual itself for guidance. Please pay special attention to all internal punctuation in notes. Examples of correct usage may be found below and in the pages of this issue.

1. Use footnotes rather than numerical keys to a reference list. Footnotes are to be identified by numbered superscripts and grouped at the end of the manuscript.

2. General footnote style:

(a) Book: John B. Author, Title (Place of Publication: Publisher, date), pp. 93-95.
(b) Article: John B. Author, "Title," Journal 21 (1947): 231-237.
(c) Chapter: John B. Author, "Title," in Title, ed. Adam B. Editor (Place of Publication) tion: Publisher, date), pp. 1-88.

3. Additional recommendations:

(a) Include first names of all authors the first time each author and each publication is cited, both in the text and in the footnotes. Use initials only if the person is generally known by those initials (e.g., B. F. Skinner).

(b) Note an appropriate running head on the title page of the manuscript.

(c) Book and article titles should have all significant words capitalized. Journal names are not abbreviated. Use short titles, rather than op. cit., for later references to the same book or article. Do not italicize ibid., if used, Attribution footnote should not be numbered. Combine several books by one author into a single note. (e.g., Smith<sup>27</sup>-NOT Smith<sup>27</sup>. <sup>28</sup>, <sup>29</sup>).

(d) Spell out numerals less than 100, e.g., nineteenth century.

Use arabic numerals throughout: vol. 3 or 138, not III or CXXXVIII.

(f) Dates should appear as follows: 23 December 1962.

(g) Those who submit book reviews should send the address of the author of the book, since we offer authors the opportunity to reply to reviews of their books.

4. Reprint information will be mailed with galley proofs. Reprints are usually available within one month of publication in the Journal.

Postmaster: Send address changes to Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences, 4 Conant Square, Brandon, VT 05733.

ISSN 0022-5061

Copyright 1992, Clinical Psychology Publishing Company, Inc.

### Journal of the

## HISTORY OF THE BEHAVIORAL SCIENCES

VOLUME XXVIII

JANUARY 1992

NUMBER 1

### CONTENTS

Wilma Koutstaal 5 Skirting the Abyss: A History of Experimental Explorations of Automatic Writing in Psychology Ideological Currents and the Interpretation of Dennis Hodgson 28 Demographic Trends: The Case of Francis Amasa Walker Michael Wertheimer Carl Jung and Max Wertheimer on a 45 Priority Issue D. Brett King Mark A. Peckler Scott Raney Roddy W. Schaef BOOK REVIEWS Review of JoAnne Brown and David van Theodore M. Porter 57 Keuren, eds., The Estate of Social Knowledge Elvin Hatch 59 Review of Marshall Hyatt, Franz Boas, Social Activitist: The Dynamics of Ethnicity Andrew Scull Review of Michael Collie, Henry Maudsley, 62 Victorian Psychiatrist: A Bibliographical Study Reviews of Konrad Koerner, Practicing Stephen O. Murray 63 Linguistic Historiography, and Konrad Koerner, ed., First Person Singular II Daniel N. Robinson Review of Fred Wilson, Psychological Analysis 68 and the Philosophy of John Stuart Mill

Metascience

73 Review of Barry Gholson, William R. Shadish,

Jr., Robert A. Neimeyer and Arthur Houts, eds., Psychology of Science: Contributions to



Seymour Mauskopf

Frank S. Pearson 76 Review of Mark S. Gaylord and John F. Galliher, The Criminology of Edwin Sutherland

#### FOREIGN BOOKS

- Katherine Arens
  77 Reviews of Manfred Pohlen and Margarethe
  Bautz-Holzherr, Eine andere Aufklarung: Das
  Freudsche Subjekt in der Analyse; Hermann
  Korte, Uber Norbert Elias: Das Werden eines
  Menschenwissenchaftlers; and Hermann Korte,
  ed., Gesellschaftliche Prozesse und individuelle
  Praxis: Bochumer Vorlesungen zu Norbert Elais'
  Zivilisationstheorie
  - Marco Orrù 81 Review of Carlo Mongardini and Simonetta Tabboni, eds., L'Opera di R. K. Merton e la sociologia contemporanea
- René van der Veer 83 Review of L. S. Vygotsky, *Pensiero a linguaggio*, annotated translation by Luciano Mecacci

#### **BRIEFLY NOTED**

- Virgina P. Dawson 85 Nature's Enigma: The Problem of the Polyp in the Letters of Bonnet, Trembley and Reamur
  - Walter Bower 85 Scotichronicon
  - David Mayall 85 Gypsy-Travellers in Nineteenth-Century Society
- Michael E. Goodrich 86 From Birth to Old Age: The Human Life Cycle in Medieval Thought
- Ben Witherington III 86 Women in the Earliest Churches
- Ida Harper Simpson 87 Fifty Years of the Southern Sociological Society: Change and Continuity in a Professional Society
  - K. R. Bradley 87 Slaves and Masters in the Roman Empire: A Study in Social Control
  - Diana H. Coole 88 Women in Political Theory: From Ancient
    Misogyny to Contemporary Feminism
- Alexander Vucinich 88 Darwin in Russian Thought
  - Peter Gay 88 A Godless Jew: Freud, Atheism, and the Making of Psychoanalysis

Jonas Frykman Orvar Lofgren	89	Culture Builders: A Historical Anthropology of Middle-Class Life
Neal Wood	89	Cicero's Social and Political Thought
Georges Vigarello	90	Concepts of Cleanliness: Changing Attitudes in France Since the Middle Ages
Joan Jacobs Brumberg	90	Fasting Girls: The Emergence of Anorexia Nervosa as a Disease
Edward Lurie	90	Louis Agassiz: A Life in Science
Susan Mendus Jane Rendall	91	Sexuality and Subordination: Interdisciplinary Studies of Gender in the Nineteenth Century
Paul Drew Anthony Wootton	91	Erving Hoffman: Exploring the Interaction Order
Charles E. Rosenberg	92	Caring for the Working Man: The Rise and Fall of the Dispensary. An Anthology of Sources
Aaron H. Esman, ed.	92	Essential Papers on Transference
Jeremy Tambling	92	Confession: Sexuality, Sin, and Subject
Lawrence R. Murphy	92	The American University in Cairo: 1919-1987
Neil J. Smelser	93	Contemporary Classics in the Social and Behavioral Sciences
Ludy T. Benjamin, Jr., et al.	93	A History of American Psychology in Notes and News, 1883-1945: An Index to Journal Sources
George H. Pollock John Munder Ross, eds.	93	The Oedipus Papers
Martin Gardner	94	The New Age: Notes of a Fringe Watcher
Guido Ruggiero	94	The Boundaries of Eros: Sex Crime and Sex- uality in Renaissance Venice
Harry Peeters Marcel Gielis Charles Caspers	94	Historical Behavioural Sciences: A Guide to the Literature
Wendy Alexander	95	First Ladies of Medicine: The Origins, Educa- tion, and Destination of Early Women Medical Graduates of Glasgow University

96 News and Notes

103 Books Received

107 Book Reviewers

## SKIRTING THE ABYSS: A HISTORY OF EXPERIMENTAL EXPLORATIONS OF AUTOMATIC WRITING IN PSYCHOLOGY

#### WILMA KOUTSTAAL

Automatic writing has been of interest to psychologists, clinicians and theoreticians of the mind both as a phenomenon in its own right and as a technique for exploring aspects of dissociation and normal and pathological consciousness. This paper follows the course of experimental investigations of automatic writing in psychology; beginning with the early work of Frederic Myers and Edmund Gurney and continuing with that of Alfred Binet, Pierre Janet, William James and Morton Prince, it centers on the 1896 experiments of Leon Solomons and Gertrude Stein, but also examines later laboratory studies. The conceptual and methodological challenges posed by automatic writing persist in such contemporary concerns as divided attention, implicit memory, and dissociations of awareness and intentionality.

This dissociation of the consciousness into mutually exclusive parts is evidently a phenomenon destined, when understood, to cast a light into the abysses of Psychology.—William James<sup>1</sup>

Automatic writing has assumed multiple identities during its many sojourns in psychology but the questions it has posed are of the enduring and deep kind that one is liable to peer into but briefly, before cautiously skirting them en route elsewhere. Seldom stated explicitly, nonetheless, behind the fledgling and more mature experimental explorations of automatic writing stir such questions as: Are mental habits acquired. and enacted, in the same way as motor habits? How much of symbolic activitygeneration, production, reproduction - occurs within the purview of awareness? Wishing to construe symbolic activity as, if not exclusively, then at least prototypically, human, does it embody too much of what lies within and close to our conceptions of freedom, of the will, and the uniqueness of the individual to be readily or unequivocally denoted "automatic"? When we approach automatic writing, are we, if we cannot discount it as fraudulent or as the product of self-deception or social collusion, too inclined to construe it as a purely motor or purely mental phenomenon, avoiding any clear conception of a possible hinterland between the maximally and minimally intelligent, the maximally and minimally individual, the maximally and minimally expressive? Do we want always to connect symbolic activity to a self, to a coherent individuality, so that any version of a disaggregation of consciousness or thought is aversive?

Much more than a mere fad, and not nearly so readily discounted as the product of fraudulent or other illicit motives as many might believe, automatic writing has found a place in the clinics, laboratories and minds of many psychologists of no little merit. As a means of tapping the degree of intelligence and perception of the subconscious,

A portion of this paper was presented at the Twelfth Annual History and Theory of Psychology Colloquium at the University of New Hampshire, 17 November 1990. Early work on the paper was encouraged by Sheldon White. Roger Brown and Kenneth Bowers read later versions. Daniel Schacter guided the paper's development at key points. I also thank an anonymous reviewer.

WILMA KOUTSTAAL is a graduate student in the Department of Psychology, Harvard University, William James Hall, 33 Kirkland Street, Cambridge, MA 02138. She is currently researching aspects of memory, especially intentional forgetting.

especially in Italy, as it provides a printed version the proceedings of a conference, held in Amalfi, Italy, in 1987, discussing the impact of Robert Merton's oeuvre in contemporary sociology. The book, skillfully edited by Carlo Mongardini and Simonetta Tabboni, assesses the status and influence of Merton's general sociological approach (part I), his conceptual analyses (part II), and provides interpretations of Merton's sociological legacy through a number of comunicazioni (part III). Robert Merton provides the final chapter of the book, with personal reflections on "Unanticipated Consequences and Kindred Sociological Ideas."

The volume is published with about half the text in Italian and half in English, roughly reflecting the composition of the participants who were summoned to Amalfi from within Italy and from abroad. The topics of the twenty-two contributions overlap to some extent, so that a few leading themes emerge, as follows: sociological ambivalence (Pierpaolo Donati, Birgitta Nedelmann, Alessandro Cavalli); unanticipated consequences of social action and manifest and latent functions (Arnold Zingerle, Peter Gerlich, Charles Crothers, and Robert Merton); the sociology of science and the sociology of knowledge (Volker Meja and Nico Stehr, Gianni Statera, Alberto Izzo, Harriet Zuckerman); the relationship between theory and empirical research and the attendant concept of serendipity (Paolo Ammassari, Maria Luisa Maniscalco, Elena Besozzi); and contributions on other scattered topics (Simonetta Tabboni, Filippo Barbano, Piotr Sztompka, Paolo Almondo, Rocco Caporale, and Giuliano Giorio). The contributions are uneven in quality (at the top are Robert Merton's postscript, along with Simonetta Tabboni's introductory essay, and Charles Crothers' case study of intellectual influences on and from Robert Merton) and in length (a few chapters are four or five pages long, others run to twenty or twenty-five pages). Altogether, the published volume reflects the shortcomings of many conferences and celebratory symposia by showing the unpolished quality of some contributions, the unfulfilled potential of some insufficiently developed insights, and the redundant ceremoniality that sometimes characterizes celebratory occasions. Perhaps this is just as it should be. The most fruitful component of conferences and of professional meetings is often not the presentation of fully developed, beautifully argued pieces of scholarship; rather, as Robert Merton writes in this book's preface, it is the "critical and spirited give-and-take of a theoretically consequential kind." This certainly must have occurred in beautiful Amalfi, where leading Italian and foreign social scientists were provided with the chance-of-a-lifetime-to engage in vibrant intellectual exchange with a sociologist who significantly shaped, directly or indirectly, their professional identity, as well as the intellect of generations of sociologists, and the standards of the entire discipline.

#### Notes

Robert K. Merton, "The Unanticipated Consequences of Purposive Social Action," American Sociological Review 1 (1936): 894–904; Robert K. Merton, "Social Structure and Anomie," American Sociological Review 3 (1938): 672–682.

E.g., Lewis Coser, ed. The Idea of Social Structure: Papers in Honor of Robert K. Merton (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1975); Piotr Sztompka, Robert K. Merton: An Intellectual Profile (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1987); Charles Crothers, Robert K. Merton: A Key Sociologist (London: Tavistock, 1987); Jon Clark, Celia Modgil, and Sohan Modgil, eds. Robert K. Merton: Consensus and Controversy (London: The Falmer Press, 1990).

3. E.g., Thomas F. Gieryn, ed. Science and Social Structure: A Festschrift for Robert K. Merton (New York: The New York Academy of Science, 1980); I. Bernard Cohen, K. E. Duffin and Stuart Strickland, eds. Puritanism and the Rise of Modern Science: The Merton Thesis (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1990); Rivka Feldhay and Yehuda Elkana, eds. "After Merton": Protestant and Catholic Science in Seventeenth-Century Europe. In Science in Context 3 (1989) entire issue.

Edward A. Tiryakian, "Evaluating the Standard: An Introduction to Sociological Metrology," Contemporary Sociology 20 (1991): 506-510. See also the entire "Symposium: Robert K. Merton in Review," Con-

temporary Sociology 20 (1991): 506-530.

5. Ibid., pp. 507-508.

Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences Volume 28, January 1992

L. S. Vygotsky, Pensiero e linguaggio. Roma: Laterza, 1990. x + 424 p. (cloth). (Annotated Italian translation of the original edition of Thought and Language by Luciano Mecacci). (Reviewed by René van der Veer)

Lev Vygotsky has gradually become well-known in English speaking countries and is now accepted as one of the classic thinkers of psychology. His last book, *Thought and Language* (originally published in 1934), has been translated into many languages and is the most well-known of his works. Unfortunately, neither in English nor in any other language has a reliable republication of *Thought and Language* been available. Leaving aside the questions that can be raised concerning the original Soviet 1934 edition (Vygotsky did not see the book in print and the editor, Kolbanovsky, changed some of the wordings to make the book more palatable for the ideological leaders), we know that the later 1956 and 1982 Soviet editions were marred by many mistakes and plain falsifications. All of the existing translations into English, or any other language, took these unreliable later editions as their point of departure. As a result, readers unable to read Russian or find a copy of the original 1934 edition have had, until now, no authoritative text of *Thought and Language* available.

The Italian expert Mecacci, in his recent translation of the original edition of Thought and Language into Italian, points out an immense series of differences among the three Soviet editions. Many of them seem the result of sloppiness, or a tendency to "improve" Vygotsky's convoluted style. But a significant number of them are best seen as a result of sustained efforts to adjust Vygotsky's text to the changing sociopolitical views in the Soviet Union. Thus, to give but two of Mecacci's examples, the word "pedology" was changed into "school psychology" in later editions and the word "test" was replaced by "investigation", or similar equivalents. Both changes reflected the infamous Pedology Decree of 1936 that banished pedology as a discipline and declared mental tests to be reactionary efforts to maintain the privileges of the bourgeois class (see van der Veer & Valsiner, 1991). In other cases mentioned by Mecacci the names of authors that Vygotsky referred to, or the quotations marks he used, were simply removed, possibly in an attempt to make Vygotsky look more original than he actually was.

In the more than 400 notes to his translation Mecacci carefully points out the many inaccuracies in the later texts and gives the details of the writings and authors to which Vygotsky referred. This makes his notes a veritable gold mine for the serious researcher.

In none of the previous Soviet or other editions had so many of the original publications—often very difficult to locate—been identified. In addition, some of Mecacci's notes explore interesting side issues, such as Piaget's claim that he had not acquainted himself with Vygotsky's critique until 1962. Mecacci convincingly argues that this statement is wholely unlikely in view of the fact that, among other things, a) Piaget corresponded regularly with Vygotsky's close collaborator Luria since the early nineteenthirties, and b) Piaget himself wrote a foreword for the Soviet edition of two of his books, which also included a lengthy critical introduction by Vygotsky.

Mecacci's careful translation is preceded by a synopsis of Vygotsky's life and work, a short discussion of several of the earlier translations, and a list of Russian key terms with their Italian equivalents. It is followed by the meticulous notes mentioned above. We may conclude that Mecacci has managed to produce the first authoritative translation of Vygotsky's major work ever to appear. For those of us who read neither Italian nor Russian the situation is now more sad than ever. The most recent English language edition of *Thought and Language* (by Plenum Press) made use of the unreliable 1982 Soviet edition (forced by contract) and is replete with transliteration and other errors. Editor and translator thus missed a unique chance to provide us with a reliable edition. It is a brave publisher who will risk a new edition within the next ten years.

### Professor Mecacci Responds:

I was very pleased to read this review by an authoritative scholar of Vygotsky. In order to summarize the results of the comparison among the 1934, 1956 and 1982 Russian versions of Vygotsky's masterpiece, a paper is in preparation for a larger and English-reading audience.

### **Briefly Noted**

Virginia P. Dawson. Nature's Enigma: The Problem of the Polyp in the Letters of Bonnet, Trembley and Réamur. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1987. ix × 266 pp. (cloth)

Two striking discoveries made 1740 a turning point in the history of eighteenth-century biology. Charles Bonnet established that aphids could reproduce without male fertilization. Shortly afterwards Abraham Trembley proved that a tiny aquatic animal, the fresh-water polyp, or hydra, could regenerate from cuttings like some plants. The discovery of the polyp was important because of the disturbing metaphysical issues it raised. In their letters written during the 1740s to Réamur, the great French academician, both Trembley and Bonnet referred to the polyp as an enigma. Not only did it seem to present a new mode of animal reproduction, previously unsuspected, but it called into question the prevailing mechanistic view of animal biology and brought into focus the problem of the animal soul.

Drawing on some of the most illuminating letters from the private archives of the Trembley family, Dr. Rawson's study focuses on the discovery of the polyp, using the correspondence of Bonnet and Trembley to understand their common Genevan background and their possible differences in approach from that of Réamur.

Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences Volume 28, January 1992

Walter Bower. Scotichronicon, Volume 8. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1987. In Latin and English. xxxii × 409 pp. \$42.00 (cloth)

Scotichronicon was composed in Latin in the 1440s while its author was abbot of the Augustinian abbey of Inchcolm, an island in the Firth of Forth. The first translation of Bower's work from Latin into English, this book presents Scotland's past as it was understood in the mid-fifteenth century, and is described by D. E. R. Watt as the crowning achievement of Scottish chronicle – writing and the most substantial work of literature produced in Scotland in the Middle Ages. We are led to understand the problems and challenges of Bower's day as they are revealed in the mind of an Augustinian abbot who was in the thick of ecclesiastical and political affairs, and we may watch a chronicler at work – through the study of the text itself, and the various revisions and marginalia.

Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences Volume 28, January 1992

David Mayall, Gypsy-Travellers in Nineteenth-Century Society. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988. x × 261 pp. (cloth)